



TEACHER TRANSFERS AND TEACHERS' PERFORMANCE IN PUBLIC PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN KIRA MUNICIPALITY, WAKISO DISTRICT, UGANDA

Serunjogi Charles Dickens

(PhD), Dean School of Education, Humanities and Social Sciences, Bugema University

Samanya Bronney,

Graduate student –Bugema University

Article history:	Abstract:
<p>Received: May 20th 2023 Accepted: June 24th 2023 Published: July 24th 2023</p>	<p>The study, focused on teacher transfer and teacher performance in Public Primary Schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District and it was guided by the following objectives; to determine the level of teacher transfer, to determine the level of teacher performance and to establish the relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in Public primary schools in Kira Municipality-Wakiso District. The study used both qualitative and quantitative approaches using both descriptive and cross-sectional survey designs. The coding of the quantitative data from the questionnaires was done. Table 2 shows high level of voluntary transfers in government aided primary schools at a mean of 3.60 with a standard deviation of 1.23. Routine transfer is high at a mean of 3.75 and standard deviation of 1.17. The sub mean of forced transfer is moderate at 3.17 with a standard deviation 1.19. Results in table 3 also indicate that due to teacher transfer there is high level of teacher performance at a grand mean of 3.60 with a standard deviation of 1.19. According to Pearson's correlation results in Table 4, teacher transfer is statistically significantly correlated with teacher performance in public primary schools in Kira Municipality Wakiso District at $r = .660$, $p = .000 < 0.05$. The study recommended that the Ministry of Education and sports should sensitize teachers about the advantages of teacher transfers. Forced transfers should be avoided since most teachers are negative about it and it negatively affects their performance. Teacher appraisals should be taken seriously as one the most sensitive tools to approve transfers. Voluntary transferred under guanine cause after close assessment, should be respected since they make a teacher to work with positive attitude leading to improved performance of teachers in terms of punctuality, lesson preparation, attendance to duty and completion of coverage</p>

Keywords:

INTRODUCTION

From the perspective of Human Resource Theory, if an organization wants to survive in a changing environment, it must retain, motivate and allocate and manage its limited human resources and achieve maximum productivity (Cheng, 2001). Appropriate transfer of public servants is considered to be a good idea because one can accumulate the relevant experience and skills through routine adjustments and job changes. Nonetheless, too frequent transfer may not be good for government agencies (Cheng, 2011). From a research carried out by Hung-Teng-Chang and Chung HaoLi (2019) and other scholars such as Chang (2000), Yang (2000), Guo (2012) and Wu (2017) evidence on transfer of public servants is based on three indicators namely family factors, personal factors and environment factors. The sub-criteria for family factors included family economic status, family support and care and needs of family members. The sub-criteria for personal factors were stated as personal ambition, enthusiasm for work, personality characteristics, workload capacity and stress resistance. Similarly, the sub-criteria for environmental factors were characterized as working environment, treatment and welfare, relationship with the superior, relationship with colleagues and external influence factors of the organization. It was noted that public servants with families pay more attention to the families' economic situation and work benefits. This is because at this level, public servants pay more attention to money such as family purchase, loans, and the need to have finances so that they take care of their old parents. In this case, more attention to money affects their reason for transfer. Personal ambitions and working environment are important factors for the transfer of public servants

In this study, focus is on teacher transfer and teacher performance in Public Primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda. Teacher transfer has emerged as one of the critical issues affecting performance in many

schools in Uganda (Komaketch, 2017). Uganda's Public Service Standing Orders stipulate that public officers including teachers shall be transferred after a continuous stay in their current postings for at least three years and not exceeding five years (MoPS, 2015). The Standing Orders also indicate that the transfers should be done in the public interest and never to be used as a punitive measure of disciplining a public officer. Teacher transfer policies should mainly be tagged to teacher distribution with the aim of ensuring that schools receive the acceptable number and quality of teachers that they deserve. The transfers may be an agile alteration in assignment within the district or from one school to another. It may also refer to appointments on employee's request or direct posting arrangements by the organization wherein an individual is asked to work in another organization at the latter's request to improve performance (Muyingo, 2010).

Studies point to two categories of transfers namely voluntary and involuntary transfers (Howard, 2006; Luschei & Chudgar, 2015). Voluntary transfer also referred to as employee initiated transfer or compassionate transfer is usually a request made by the teacher for exceptional reasons. Such a request may be made at any time and may not be subject to annual transfer processes. In circumstances where transfer policies are taken seriously, a teacher must provide documented request of any medical condition or disability that may be used as a basis for the request. Others may request for transfers because of the need to relocate closer to their homes or a favorable geographical location or any urgent family reasons.

On the other hand, involuntary transfer is a transfer initiated by school authorities or an organization (Noor et al, 2012). Such a transfer is sometimes referred to as employer initiated transfer. This may be done to meet the staffing needs of schools due to changing school enrolment or changed school requirement. Where teachers in a certain skill area and geographical location are eligible for a required transfer, numerous factors can be considered including their employment history and the years of service they have completed in their current appointment to determine their relative order of transfer. It is evident that in Uganda, such transfers are forced on teachers whose performance may be seen to be unsatisfactory (Komakech, 2017). However, studies reveal that teachers may also be transferred due to promotional reasons (Staub, 2004). Teachers who are on promotion usually find themselves being transferred to other locations where their services or skills may be urgently required.

It is also evident that in Uganda, teacher transfers have been found to be used systematically by politicians as a mechanism to extend favours to politically useful teachers and to reprimand teachers who may appear unhelpful (Komakech, 2017). Noor et al (2012) aver that involuntary transfers greatly affect individual performance of teachers. This is manifested through their level of commitment and productivity at work. After a forced transfer, it is likely that teachers' morale may drop drastically due to unbearable conditions or unfavorable work environments that may force them to be irregular or ineffective at their new stations. There are cases where the new workplace may be located in remote areas with few or no amenities at all (Komakech, 2017). In such cases, teachers have always been accused of poor time management due to the long distances they have to travel between home and school. To the contrary, it has been observed that teacher effectiveness was found to be higher after a voluntary transfer to a different school (Jackson, 2010).

Teacher performance is one of the critical aspects that determine the success of the teaching /learning processes in schools. This is manifested in the way teachers perform their roles in terms of attendance to duty, accomplishment of teaching tasks in terms of syllabus coverage, participation in co- curricular activities, punctuality at work and the overall management of the teaching or learning process. To effectively manage teacher performance, Government of Uganda (GoU) through the Ministry of Public Service developed an employee working document known as the Uganda Public Service Standing orders; parts of which states that civil servants including teachers should be transferred after a continuous stay in their current posting for at least three years but not exceeding five years (Ibwong & Komakech, 2021). These transfers are meant to improve performance among public servants including teachers .

Despite the above initiative by the Government of Uganda, performance of teachers in Kira Municipality remains low in terms of effective lesson preparation, attendance to duty, accomplishment of teaching tasks in terms of syllabus coverage, participation in co- curricular activities and punctuality at work (Kira Municipality, 2018). This dismal performance by teachers if not checked may lead to inconsistencies in academic achievement of learners in Kira Municipality. Given this state of affair, no empirical study has been conducted to investigate teacher transfer and how it influences teacher performance in Kira Municipality. This study therefore, is intended to bridge the aforementioned gap so that relevant recommendations are suggested to curb the situation of poor teacher performance in Kira Municipality, Uganda.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

1. To determine the level of teacher transfers in public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda.
2. To determine the level of teacher performance in public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda.
3. To establish the relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in Public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda.

STUDY HYPOTHESIS

1. There is no significant relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso district, Uganda.

METHODOLOGY

The study employed both descriptive and cross-sectional survey designs, using both qualitative and quantitative research approaches. The descriptive design was useful in gathering information or data on attitudes and preferences, beliefs, behavior and experiences of teachers, head teachers, inspector of schools and a Municipal Education Officer as they naturally occur (Borg Gall 1989). The cross-sectional design helped in saving time as it was cost effective to administer questionnaires to teachers at ago per interval (Cohen, Manion and Morrison 2007). The design was to facilitate the collection and analysis of data using both quantitative and qualitative approaches with the purpose of providing a better understanding of the research problem and question (Creswell 2009). Qualitative data was collected from head teachers, inspectors of schools and the Municipal Education Officer as key respondents to the study because they are well versed with teacher transfer and teacher performance in public primary schools of Kira Municipality. Yet quantitative data was collected from teachers who are directly affected by transfers. Therefore, the researcher through quantitative data intended to find out the relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance. More over the design provided an opportunity for equal representation of views among the respondents (Creswell, 2014).

The study population comprised of teachers and headteachers of the Public Primary Schools and the Education Officers in Kira Municipality. The total population was 302 respondents. The sample size for the study was determined using Krejcie and Morgan table (Krejcie & Morgan, 1970).Therefore, out of the total population of 302, a sample size of 169 respondents was selected. According to the table, if the total population is 302, then the sample is 169 respondents.

To collect quantitative data from teachers, a closed – ended questionnaire was employed while interview guide was used to collect data from head teachers, inspector of schools and the Municipal Education Officer. The method was appropriate for collecting of information from the number of teachers who could read, write, and interpret questions. The questionnaire was employed because it is practical, inexpensive and easy to analyze and visualize. The method eased the process of analyzing and interpretation of quantitative data collected.

An interview guide was used to collect qualitative data as advocated by Kabir (2018). Interviews involve asking questions and getting answers for the study. The method involved the presentation of oral, verbal stimuli and responses. The interviews were administered to the inspectors of schools and the Municipal Education Officer to solicit views on a wide range of issues concerning teacher transfers and teachers’ performance in public primary schools in Kira Municipality –Wakiso. Analysis of interview data from head teachers helped to substantiate some of the teachers’ responses given in questionnaires and enriched information collected using other data collection methods. Additionally, document review was conducted to get supplementary information from the available documents from the District Education Office and schools. Document review check list was used to provide a systematic procedure for identifying useful information from the existing documents about teacher transfer and teacher performance in public primary schools of Kira. Personal documents and official documents were reviewed to establish whether different issues related to transfers affected performance of teachers in Public primary schools. The method allowed for easy access to vast amount of information with minimal cost. The documents which were reviewed included; Kira Municipal transfer schedules, head teachers’ supervision reports, inspection reports, individual teacher records and school Management Committee minutes.

FINDINGS

Level of Teacher Transfers in Public Primary Schools, Kira Municipality

The first objective of this study was to determine the level of teacher transfers in the Public Primary Schools in Kira Municipality. Table 3 below shows the descriptive results on the level of teacher transfers in Kira municipality in terms of voluntary transfers, routine transfers and forced transfers.

Table 3: Descriptive Results on the Level of Teacher Transfers (IV) in public primary schools of Kira Municipality

Transfers	Mean	Std. Deviation
Voluntary Transfers		
We are free to apply for transfers to other schools.	3.73	1.32
Voluntary transfers help teachers to opt for new work environment where they can be able to manage time effectively.	3.45	1.32
Voluntary transfers motivate teachers to work harder and participate in all school activities.	3.51	1.20
Voluntary transfers enable teachers to express themselves and make choice of their next place of work where they can accomplish the teaching tasks effectively.	3.42	1.26

Voluntary transfers promote good working relationship between teachers and their supervisors.	3.63	1.16
Teachers with health-related issues are always allowed to transfer to schools near their homes for regularity.	3.85	1.14
Sub Mean & Standard Deviation	3.60	1.23
Routine Transfers		
Routine transfers help teachers to improve their performance in terms of attendance to duty, accomplishment of the teaching tasks in terms of syllabus coverage and punctuality at work.	3.96	1.24
Teachers are always prepared for transfer whenever they spend 5 years in a school.	3.85	1.16
Routine transfers enhance innovativeness of teachers to be punctual at work, prepare lessons and be regular.	3.85	1.05
Routine transfers help to change working environment for effective teaching.	3.37	1.25
Routine transfers help teachers to transfer knowledge and skills from one school to another.	3.61	1.15
Routine transfers help teachers to build networks for improved teaching.	3.85	1.14
Sub Mean & Standard Deviation	3.75	1.17
Forced Transfers		
Teachers who are not loyal to their supervisors should be subjected to forced transfer.	2.04	1.24
Teachers who are not effective in time management should be subjected to forced transfer.	2.15	1.16
Teachers who don't accomplish the teaching tasks as required should be subjected to forced transfer.	2.15	1.05
Teachers who don't participate in school activities should be subjected to forced transfer.	2.41	1.16
School Management Committee always recommend for the transfer of teachers whenever they feel it is in the interest of the school.	2.15	1.14
PTA always recommend for the transfer of teachers whenever they feel it is in the interest of the school.	2.04	1.24
Sub Mean & Standard Deviation	2.16	1.16
Grand Mean & Standard Deviation	3.17	1.19

Legend: 4.20-5.00 Very High 3.40-4.19 High, 2.60-3.39 Moderate, 1.80-2.59 Low, 1.00-1.79 Very Low
 Source: Primary Data (2022)

In table 3, results show a high level of voluntary transfers in government aided primary schools at a mean of 3.60 with a standard deviation of 1.23. The mean at which teachers freely apply for transfers is 3.73 with a standard deviation of 1.32. From the findings, it is also evident that voluntary transfers help teachers to opt for new work environments where they can effectively manage time; this was at a mean of 3.45 with a standard deviation of 1.32. It was also noted that transfers helped to improve teachers' regularity at work at high mean of 3.85 with a standard deviation of 1.14.

Result also revealed that the level of routine transfer is high at a mean of 3.75 and standard deviation of 1.17. It is indicated that teacher transfers helped teachers to improve their performance in terms of attendance to duty, accomplishment of teaching tasks and punctuality at work at a mean of 3.96 and standard deviation of 1.24. Teachers' willingness to accept transfer was also high at a mean 3.85 and standard deviation of 1.16. The mean of routine transfer and teachers' punctuality and regularity at work, and preparation of lessons was high at 3.85 and standard deviation of 1.05.

It was also indicated that the sub-mean of forced transfer was low at 2.16 with a standard deviation of 1.16. The grand mean of forced transfer was moderate at a mean of 3.17 with a standard deviation of 1.19. It is also evident that because of forced transfer, teachers' time management was constrained at a mean of 2.15 with a standard deviation of 1.16. It was also revealed that when teachers got transferred, the level of syllabus coverage was at a mean of 2.15 with the standard deviation of 1.05. Whenever school management committee recommended transfer of teachers, the performance was low with a mean of 2.15 and a standard deviation of 1.14. Furthermore, results show that whenever teachers are not loyal to their supervisors and get transferred, their performance lowers at mean of 2.04 and with a standard deviation of 1.24. Similarly, PTA recommendations of teacher transfer were seen to be lowering performance of teachers at a mean of 2.04 with standard deviation of 1.24. Therefore, it can be summarily stated that whenever teachers are forced to transfer, their performance in terms of attendance to duty, accomplishment of teaching tasks, syllabus coverage and punctuality at work lowers. However, it was also found out

that when the teachers are allowed to transfer to other schools voluntarily, there is a moderate improvement on time management and participation in other relevant school activities like games and sports.

An analysis of qualitative data also revealed similar results as one of the respondents noted;

If distance from one’s residence to workplace is too long, it interferes with one’s participation in school programmes such as co-curricular activities.....(K1, 2022)

The response above indicates that whenever there is an intention of transferring a teacher, many factors have to be considered. There is need to consider the impact of the intended transfer on school programmes.

Another respondent also noted that;

Routine transfers make teachers hate the teaching profession, since all the time they have to get worried of adopting to the new environment as they leave their families behind...(K2, 22)

This implies that transfers have to be done carefully. Enough consultation is required before a teacher is transferred from one school to another.

Level of Teacher Performance in Public Primary Schools in Kira Municipality

The second objective of the study sought to establish the level of teacher performance in public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda. Table 4 above shows results on teacher performance in the Public Primary Schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso district.

Table 4: Descriptive Results on the Teachers’ Performance in Public Primary Schools of Kira Municipality

Teachers’ Performance Aspects	Mean	Std. Deviation
I always prepare schemes and lesson plans for all the subjects allocated to me.	3.85	1.16
I always teach and cover the syllabus as planned.	3.85	1.05
Am always punctual for duty.	3.42	1.31
I always meet deadlines as planned by the school.	3.51	1.20
I always apply learner centered method of teaching.	3.38	1.24
I always participate in co- curricular activities as planned.	3.59	1.16
Grand Mean & Standard Deviation	3.60	1.19

Legend: 4.20-5.00 Very High 3.40-4.19 High, 2.60-3.39 Moderate, 1.80-2.59 Low, 1.00-1.79 Very Low
Source: Primary Data (2022)

Results in table 4 above indicate that teachers’ preparation of schemes of work and lessons was at a mean of 3.85 with standard deviation of 1.16. Teachers’ syllabus coverage was also high at a mean of 3.85 with a standard deviation of 1.05. However, teachers’ punctuality at work was at a mean of 3.42 with a standard deviation of 1.31. Meeting deadlines by teacher was at a mean of 3.51 and a standard deviation of 1.20; yet the application of learner-centered method of teaching was at a mean of 3.38 with a standard deviation of 1.24. This implied that teachers in public primary schools in Kira Municipality didn’t use learner-centred methods during the learning/learning process.

In a related interview, one respondent noted;

Routine transfer helps teachers to transfer knowledge and skills from one school to another and also it helps teachers to build networks for improved teaching.... (K2, 2022)

This was a clear indication that some respondents appreciated the value of teacher transfer to improve performance through regularity at work, effective lesson preparation and preparation of lesson plans and schemes of work.

Regarding forced transfers, another respondent opined;

"Forced transfer is painful to teachers; they don’t perform well, they feel demotivated and not appreciated. This is so disastrous to schools". (K1, 2022)

From the above statement, it implies that the forced transfers negatively affect teachers’ performance. Teachers lose morale and report late for duty, they also fail to prepare schemes of work and lesson plans and become irregular.

Results from document review

Documents which were reviewed included the schedule of transfers of the five years under review - 2017, 2018, 2019, 2020 and 2021. Reports written about the conduct of teachers submitted by head teachers in different schools were also reviewed. Additionally, performance appraisals of some teachers in the selected schools were also reviewed. Documents reviewed revealed that the Municipal Education Officer (MEO) gave various reasons why transfers were proposed for some teachers. The reasons for transfers included; over stay, voluntary requests for transfers, forced transfers due to incompetence or low performance in one particular station and due to recommendations and demands form parents and other stake holders. There were also letters written by head teachers, parents and foundation bodies calling for transfer of particular teachers in some schools.

Relationship between Teacher Transfer and Teacher Performance in Public Primary Schools in Kira Municipality

The third objective of the study was set to establish the relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in Public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda.

Table 5: Pearson’s Correlation Results on the Relationship between Teacher Transfer and Teacher Performance in Public Primary Schools in Kira Municipality Wakiso District, Uganda

	Correlations	Teacher Performance
Overall Teacher Transfer	Pearson Correlation	.660**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000
	N	142

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

According to Pearson’s correlation results in Table 5, teacher transfer is statistically significantly correlated with teacher performance in public primary schools in Kira Municipality Wakiso District at $r = .660, p = .000 < 0.05$. This relationship implies that the higher the teacher transfer, the higher the level of performance amongst the teachers and the lower the teacher transfer, the lower the level of performance amongst the teachers.

The hypothesis of the study was, “there is no significant relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso district”. This hypothesis was tested using p-value and level of significance of 0.05. Since the p-value of 0.000 was less than the level of significance of 0.05, the Null Hypothesis that there is no significant relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in public primary schools of Kira Municipality, Wakiso district was rejected and the Alternative Hypothesis that there is a significant relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in public primary schools of Kira Municipality, Wakiso district, Uganda was accepted.

CONCLUSION

The study was guided by the following objectives; to determine the level of teacher transfer, to determine the level of teacher performance and to establish the relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in Public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda. The study used both qualitative and quantitative approaches using both descriptive and cross-sectional survey designs. It was concluded that there is a significant relationship between teacher transfer and teacher performance in Public primary schools in Kira Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda. Transfer of teachers affects their performance in terms of lesson preparation, punctuality, regularity and commitment at work.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are suggested;

- i. The Ministry of Education and Sports (MoES) in Uganda should come up with a teacher transfer policy to regulate the transfer of teachers from one station to another.
- ii. Transfers should not be used as a tool for disciplining teachers rather; it should aim at improving performance and productivity of teachers.
- iii. Transfer of teachers should not be politicized. It should base on an effective assessment and appraisal of teachers on a regular basis.
- iv. Transfer of teachers shouldn’t be an abrupt process. Teachers on transfer ought to be given ample time to prepare for the relocation to their new stations.

REFERENCES.

1. Amin, E. M. (2005). *Social Science Research Conception, Methodology & Analysis*. Kampala: Makerere University Printer.
2. Bailey, K. D. (1994). *Methods of Social Research*, (4th Ed). New York: Free Press.
3. Chen, C.S (2000). *The Performance Appraisal of Human Resource Management to the Appraisal in the Public Sector – View of the Area in Natou County Government*, Department of Public and Administration, Master’s Thesis, Department of Educational Management ; National Taipei University of Education.
4. Cohen, J.A. (1960). *Coefficient of Agreement for Nominal Scales*. Journal of Educational and Psychological Measurement, 20, 37-46.
5. Chang, C.Y(2000). *The Search of Internal Transfer- Master’s Thesis-Graduate School of Labour Relation*, National Chung Cheng University.
6. Guo, C.W(2012). *Study on the Relevance of Deviation Behavioral Intention in Original Unit and Type of Transfer Measures-* Master’s thesis, Graduate School of Resource Management and Decision Science, Nation Defense University
7. Howard, S. E. (2006). *Career satisfaction and resilience among Oklahoma band directors*, Unpublished Doctoral Thesis. University of Oklahoma.
8. Hung-Teng Cheng, Chiung-HaoLi(2019). *Public Servants Transfer Factor Analysis and Discussion; A case Study of a City Hall in Miaoli County*, International Journal of Managerial Studies and Research Vol. 7(7) 1-6

8. Ibwing etal (2021). Teacher transferand teachers' performance: Experience from Uganda primary schools . Noble International Journal of Social Sciences Research . ISSN(e),2519- 9722Vol.06,No06,pp;36-98,2021
9. Jackson, K. (2010). *Match quality, worker productivity, and worker mobility: Direct evidence from teachers*. Working paper No. 15990. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research.
10. Kabir (2016). *Basic guide lines for Research: An Introductory Approach for All Discipline Book Zone Publication* , Chittagong -4205, Bangladesh.
11. Kabir, S.M.S. (2018). *Psychological Health Challenges of the Hill-tracts Region for Climate Change in Bangladesh. Asian Journal of Psychiatry, Elsevier,34, 74–77.*
12. Komaketch, R. A. (2017). *Using Zero Money to Tackle the Challenges of Universal Education in Africa: A Case of Universal Secondary Education in Uganda*. International Journal of Humanities Social Sciences and Education, 4(5): 29-42.
13. Krejcie, R. V. and Morgan, D. W. (1970). *Determining Sample Size for Research Activation. Education and Psychological Measurement*, 30-608. Sage Publications.
14. MoPS (2015). *The Uganda Public Service Standing Orders* (2010 Ed), GoU.
15. Mulkeen, A. and Chen, D. (2008). *Teachers for Rural Schools: Experiences in Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Tanzania and Uganda*, Africa Human Development Series. The World Bank. Washington, DC 20433.
16. Muyingo, M. (2010). *Effect of Forms of Transfer on Administrative Performance of Head-Teachers in Government Aided Secondary Schools in Uganda; A case study of Mukono district*. Unpublished
17. Noor, F., Ishaque, S. M., Memon, A. A. and Lodhi, F. A. (2012). *Effects of Teachers' Transfer on School System*. Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business, 4(2): 85-94.
18. Yang, H.R(2010). *Research on Relationship Between Job Burnout, Job Satisfaction and Job Transfer Tendencies in Grassroots Police; Take the Hualien County Police as an Examl*, Masters Thesis – Graduate School of Administration and Management, Central Police University.
19. Wu, M.H (2017). *Study on the Departure Tendency of Government Departments, A study of Taipei City Government*, The Chinese Public Administration Review, 23(3).