



IMPLEMENTATION OF CITIZEN'S CHARTER IN WESTERN PHILIPPINES UNIVERSITY, ABORLAN, PALAWAN

Maribel Dajao Limsa¹, Edison C. Gabileo², and Randy G. Olano³

Western Philippines University¹²³

Article history:	Abstract:
<p>Received: 10th February 2022 Accepted: 10th March 2022 Published: 26th April 2022</p>	<p>The main objective of the study was to determine the level of implementation of Citizen's Charter in Western Philippines University which was conducted from August 22, 2017 to September 21, 2017. Specifically, this study aimed to determine the following: implementation of the Citizen's Charter; the significant difference between client-respondents and employee-respondents assessment levels; and respondents' problems encountered, and suggestions for the improvement of the Citizens Charter implementation. Data were gathered through survey questionnaires from 240 clients and 65 frontline employees and analyzed using frequency counts, means, percentages, ranks and t-test. Respondents perceived that there was a very good implementation on the aspects of compliance to the Citizen's Charter provisions, frontline service delivery, service quality, physical working condition while on feedback and redress mechanism, were perceived as good. The results revealed that the implementation of Citizen's Charter in Western Philippines University was very good (90% to 99%). Findings further revealed that there was no significant difference between clients' and employees' level of assessment on the aspects of compliance to provisions and service quality. There was a significant difference on their assessment in relation to frontline service delivery, feedback and redress mechanism, and physical working condition. Moreover, there were varied problems encountered by the respondents in the implementation of the Charter and that issues on employees' behavior towards clients was the most felt problem. Continued information campaign, hastening of the processes, employees' adherence to the norms of conduct, strengthening of feedback and redress mechanism, and improvement of the basic facilities were recommended.</p>

Keywords: Citizen's Charter, Clients, Frontline Services, Service delivery, Client Satisfaction, Norms and Conduct, feedback and Redress Mechanism, Western Philippines University

INTRODUCTION

Citizens throughout the world are demanding governments to deliver better quality and more efficient public services that respond to their needs (Mendoza, 2011). All public services are paid for by the individual citizens, either directly or through taxes; they are entitled to expect high quality services, responsive to their needs, provided efficiently at a reasonable cost and where the state is engaged in regulating, taxing or administering justice, these functions too must be carried out fairly, effectively and courteously, as mentioned by Barrett (2003).

It is not unusual to hear fusses of citizens after transacting in various levels of government bureaucracies. Most of these gripes are problems on red tape, coupled by the specific problems on corruption, inefficiency, integrity and competence in public service delivery (Masucol, 2014).

Red tape is the rigid adherence to routine and regulations, causing delay (Webster's Dictionary and Thesaurus, 2002). In the Philippine context, red tape referred as having to deal with voluminous requirements and seemingly endless processes to simply secure certificates or licenses and that it has been recognized to have permeated the bureaucracy and long been embedded in our culture (Puno 2008). Also, red tape describes regulations and rules, administrative procedures and systems that are not effective in achieving their intended objectives and as a result produces suboptimal and undesired social outcome (S.B. No. 1311, 17th Congress of the Republic of the Philippines).

In June 2, 2007, Republic Act 9485 or the Anti-Red Tape Act (ARTA) of 2007 was signed into law by President Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo. It aims to promote transparency in government with regard to the manner of transacting with the public by requiring each agency to simplify frontline service procedures, formulate service standards to observe in every transaction and make known these standards to the client.

Western Philippines University (WPU) is a Higher Education Institution (HEI). Among of its objectives are to implement effective administrative systems and processes, and upgrade of physical facilities. However, studies

conducted by students of WPU revealed that some of the problems encountered by users in Computer Training Institute were on facilities and attitude of the staff (Bacosa, Limbos and Escubin 2011). While, slow processing services of the Registrar's Office were the major problem encountered by the students (Lorzano and Magbanua, 2013). In addition, limited space in the receiving area, lack of personnel, lack of facilities, poor attitude in working were the top four (4) among the eight (8) problems encountered by the graduating students in availing the services rendered by the Office of Student Services (Vergara, Soliven, Jr. and Tahil, 2013).

At present, the University has been compliant in the implementation of the Anti-Red Tape Law especially on the setting up of Citizen's Charter for improved delivery of frontline offices. However, questions linger on the extent and consistencies of its implementation to ensure that clients transacting business with the frontline offices especially the students who are the direct clients of the university receive an excellent service delivery.

This study measures the level of implementation on Citizen's Charter in the university after ten (10) years of its effectivity as perceived by frontline employees and clients. Survey questionnaires were distributed to the frontline employees and clients who have availed services in the frontline offices of the University: Accounting Office, Cashier's Office, Computer Training Institute, IGP and Auxiliary Office, Infirmary, Library, Office of Student Affairs and Services, and Registrar's Office. The views and data gathered serve as basis for data analysis to determine the level of implementation of the Charter. Likewise, the result of the study may be used as a source of information for further improvement of its implementation.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

Given the various campaigns and interventions conducted by the Philippine government, the researchers would like to determine the implementation of the Citizen's Charter at Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan. Specifically, it aimed to determine the level of the Citizen's Charter implementation, analyze the significant difference on the client and employee respondents about their level of assessment on the following: compliance to Citizen's Charter provisions, frontline service delivery, service quality, feedback and redress mechanism, and physical working condition; and identify the problems encountered by the respondents and their suggestions for the improvement of the implementation of the Citizen's Charter in Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Red Tape and Bureaucracy

Way back in 2007, the Philippine legislation has passed the Anti-Red Tape Act. This was meant to create a framework of implementing rules for all government transactions in order to speed up important processes. However, years later, in 2015, the Philippines still places 103rd out of 189 world economies, when ranked according to ease of doing business, thus, red tape is still a prevalent problem for businesses (Hirsh, 2016).

Red Tape refers to bureaucratic procedure especially as characterized by mechanical adherence to regulations, needless duplication of records, and the compilation of an excessive amount of extraneous information resulting in prolonged delay or inaction (Webster's Dictionary). To Rosenfeld's (1984) red tape is defined as the sum of government guidelines, procedures, and forms that are perceived as excessive, unwieldy, or pointless in relation to official decisions and policy delay while Caiden (1991) referred red tape as several forms of perceived incompetence, maladministration, and delay as condensed by Bozeman (1993).

In the Philippine context, Puno (2008) referred red tape as having to deal with voluminous requirements and seemingly endless processes to simply secure certificates or licenses and that it has been recognized to have permeated the bureaucracy and long been embedded in our culture. For Bala (2017), red tape is the enemy of a high-trust society which breaks down trust between government and its citizens, makes simple things complicated and breeds unnecessary processes that provide opportunity for corruption and fixing. Furthermore, red tape describes regulations and rules, administrative procedures and systems that are not effective in achieving their intended objectives and as a result produces suboptimal and undesired social outcome (S.B. No. 1311, 17th Congress of the Republic of the Philippines) and has always been synonymous with the government bureaucracy as mentioned by Mendoza (2011).

Bureaucracy as conceived by Weber (1973) is a structured hierarchy in which salaried officials reached rational decisions by applying explicit rules on the facts before them. Weber added that bureaucracy is the best form of organization where bureaucrats follow rules and orders voluntarily because they are given by office holders as trustees of a legitimate and impersonal rational-legal order. These days, it is understood that bureaucracy refers to the salaried officials who conduct business and intricacies of government (and private sector) advising on, and applying to, policy decisions (Lazo, 2010). However, a fundamental failure of bureaucracy was its tendency to foster 'goal displacement'. Excessive adherence and conformity to rules and regulations resulted in rules becoming ends in themselves, and sometimes prevented organizations from achieving their real goals (Merton, 1957). Additionally, organizational members in bureaucracies often tried to apply formal rules and procedures in unsuitable situations - for example in unique situations, treating them as routine - thus resulting in dysfunctional outcomes (Merton, 1976).

Republic Act 9485

Philippine government has various laws addressing graft and corruption and reducing red tape in the bureaucracy, enumerating prohibited acts and transactions and providing penalties for violations committed. In June 2, 2007, RA 9485 was signed into law by President Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo entitled "An Act to Improve Efficiency in the

Delivery of Government Service to the Public by reducing Bureaucratic Red Tape Preventing Graft and Corruption, and Providing Penalties Therefore" otherwise known as the Anti-Red Tape Act (ARTA) of 2007.

The ARTA of 2007 aims to promote transparency in government with regard to the manner of transacting with the public by requiring each agency to simplify frontline service procedures, formulate service standards to observe in every transaction and make known these standards to the client. Section 6 of this Act provides that all government agencies shall set up their respective service standards to be known as the Citizen's Charter in the form of information billboards and in the form of published materials that details the procedure to obtain a particular service; person/s responsible for each step; the maximum time to conclude the process; the document/s to be presented by the customer; the amount of fees; and the procedure for filing complaints. This Act likewise holds the agency heads to be responsible for its implementation and accountable in rendering fast, efficient, convenient and reliable services (Sec. 7, RA 9485).

Citizen's Charter (CC)

Historically, Citizen's Charter was initiated by a British Prime Minister John Major, on 22 July 1991 which was launched less than a year into his premiership. The charter aimed to improve public services in the UK by making administration accountable and citizen friendly; ensuring transparency and the right to information; taking measures to cleanse and motivate civil service; adopting a stakeholder approach; saving time of both executant and the clientele; and easily under stability and quantified works (Mullen 2006).

Post and Sanjay (2011) stated that Citizen's Charters are public agreements between citizens and service delivery providers that clearly codify expectations and standards in the realm of service delivery and are being used to improve the quality of service delivery and enhance public sector

CSC Reporter 2017, 2nd Issue presented that: Citizen's Charter is an accountability tool that tells the public what to expect in transacting with a government office; it tells clients, "These are the steps you will have to undergo and the fees to be paid. Those other than what are stated are unauthorized and unnecessary"; serves as an agency's covenant to observe the "No Noon Break policy", an anti-fixer campaign of the government, mandates the set-up of Public Assistance and Complaints Desk; promotes speedy and transparent frontline service; eliminates the need for fixers; and discourages civil servants from engaging in corruption and the transacting public from tolerating it. For crafting of a Citizen's Charter, CSC Reporter elaborated that the initial step is to streamline frontline service procedures by reviewing them and identifying unnecessary steps and fees that can be eliminated. After streamlining, the agency posts its Citizen's Charter in the form of billboards or signages written either in English, Filipino, or in the local dialect which must be posted at the main entrance of offices or at the most conspicuous place.

However, it is not enough to install the Citizen's Charter of the agency because as part of the customer service ethos, it is important to ensure that the Citizen's Charter is conspicuously seen and felt by the transacting public through effective service delivery (CSC-SDEP 2010). For Abera (2015), he signified that implementing the Charter without the staff owning it, will defeat the purpose of the Charter. Hence, he added that there is a need to train and sensitize all officials so that they can get familiar with the spirit of a Citizen Charter.

To improve efficiency in the delivery of government services, all offices and agencies providing frontline services shall be subjected to a Report Card Survey to be initiated by the Civil Service Commission in coordination with Development Academy of the Philippines. This survey shall be used used to obtain feedback on hour provisions in the Citizen's Charter are being followed and how the agency is performing (Sec 10, RA 9485). Also, all offices and agencies which provide frontline services are hereby mandated to regularly undertake time and motion studies, undergo evaluation and improvement of their transaction systems and procedures and re-engineer the same if deemed necessary to reduce bureaucratic red tape and processing time (Sec 6, RA 9485).

Thus, this study was conducted not just to determine the level of implementation of the citizen's charter in the university but also to identify which aspect needs to be improved to ensure that transacting public get quality service.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The research design used in this study was descriptive research method, specifically survey method to determine the level of implementation of Citizen's Charter at Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan. The results of the study were limited to the experiences of the respondents on each of the frontline offices and do not represent the entire university. The evaluation was intended to provide the university an insight on the level of implementation of the Citizen's Charter that maybe used for reengineering of systems and procedures.

According to Singh (2012), Citizen's Charter sees public services through the eyes of those who use them that for so long the provider has dominated and now it is the turn of the user. He added that, principles of the Citizen's Charter are simple but tough and give more power to the citizens and more freedom to choose.

Hence, the target population were the clients transacting business in the frontline offices in WPU main campus: Accounting Office, Cashier's Office, Computer Training Institute, IGP and Auxiliary Office, Infirmary, Library, Office of Student Affairs and Services, and Registrar's Office. Thirty (30) selected clients transacting business in every frontline office with a total of two hundred forty (240) client-respondents selected through accidental sampling during the survey since the number and category of clients transacting in frontline offices vary. Further, total sampling of 65 frontline employees were subjected in the survey as employee-respondents.

The instrument used by Masucol (2014) in her masteral thesis was the basis of the survey questionnaire. However, some of the contents were translated/revised to fit the respondents who were the employees and clients of Western Philippines University, main campus.

Two sets of survey questionnaire were used in the gathering of data. Set I was for the client-respondents and the Set II was for the frontline employee-respondents. The survey questionnaire was adopted to gather the necessary information to be used in assessing the level of implementation of the Charter with thirty-four (34) statements wherein each statement was rated by the respondents using the scale, rating. 5 is excellent (E)-100% implementation; 4 is Very Good (VG) with 90% to 99% implementation; 3 is Good (G) with 80% to 89% implementation; 2 is Fair (F) with 70% to 79% implementation; and 1 is Poor (P) with below 70% implementation.

The questionnaire was validated by having it pre-tested to selected respondents from clients and employees to ensure that items are free from errors, easily understood, and to determine the length of time needed and relatedness to the study.

Letter of request asking permission to conduct the study was sent to the University President. After the request was approved, survey questionnaires were distributed to the respondents who were willing to participate in the survey and collected after the questionnaire were duly accomplished.

The data gathered were tabulated and subjected to statistical treatment using frequency counts, percentages, means, ranks and t-test. To determine the level of implementation of Citizen’s Charter at WPU, Aborlan, Palawan, it was analyzed through means as reflected the following scale: rating, and descriptions: 4.50 – 5.00 is Excellent (E) on 100% implementation; 3.50 – 4.49 is Very Good (VG) with 90% to 99% implementation; 2.50 – 3.49 is Good (G) with 80% to 89% implementation; 1.50 – 2.49 is Fair (F) with 70% to 79% implementation; and lastly, 1.00 – 1.49 is Poor (P) with having below 70% implementation

Whereas t-test at .01 and .05 level of significance with the aid of statistical software in Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) Licensed Program was used to determine the significant difference between client-respondents and employee-respondents’ level of assessment on the following: compliance to citizen’s charter, frontline service delivery, service quality, feedback and redress mechanism, and physical working condition.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

This contains the presentation of data with corresponding analysis and interpretation related to the problems posited.

Implementation of the Citizen’s Charter (CC) in Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan

The results and discussions in this portion were based on the assessment made by the two groups of respondents – clients and frontline employees as to the level of implementation of CC in terms of: (1) compliance to Citizen’s Charter provisions; (2) frontline service delivery; (3) service quality; (4) feedback and redress mechanism; and (5) physical working condition.

Compliance to Citizen’s Charter provisions

Table 4a shows the frontline offices’ compliance to Citizen’s Charter provisions as perceived by client-respondents. It reveals that Official Receipt is issued for all payments collected was given the highest mean rating (4.53) with a descriptive rating of excellent, while the rest of the statements were perceived as very good in which procedures for making complaints are presented (3.60) received the lowest rating. Overall, the mean rating of (4.16) described as “very good” implies that client-respondents have a consensus assessment that frontline service providers have successfully implemented the core aspects however they perceived that not all provisions of the Charter were fully complied.

Table 4a. Assessment of client-respondents on compliance of Citizen’s Charter Provisions

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
1	Official Receipt is issued for all payments collected	4.53	E
2	“No noon break” policy is observed and clients are attended to even after official work hours	4.47	VG
3	Citizen’s Charter and anti-fixer campaign materials are published and posted at the main entrance of the office or at a very conspicuous place	4.33	VG
4	Official identification card of employees transacting with the clients is easy to read and visibly worn	4.26	VG
5	Citizen’s Charter is written either in English, Filipino, or in local dialect and available as an information material (e.g., booklet, brochure or leaflets)	4.20	VG
6	Public Assistance and Complaints Desk (PACD) is established and manned by a knowledgeable officer of the day even during break time	3.93	VG
7	Citizen’s Charter uploaded in the University’s website is accessible	3.93	VG

8	Procedures for making complaints are presented	3.60	VG
GRAND MEAN		4.16	VG

On the other hand, employee-respondents shared the same assessment with the clients with an overall mean rating of (4.21) described as “very good” as shown in Table 4b. This implies that frontline employees confirmed to have successfully implemented and complied with the Charter provisions.

Comparing the rating of both the respondents, it can be observed that the lowest mean though positively assessed was on the presentation of procedures for making complaints. Clients would have voiced out their feedback/grievances if the step-by- step procedures were visibly seen and displayed in the offices, for awareness and proper guidance, which cannot be found in the published and posted Charter neither at the PACD. What can be found in the later portion of the Charter was the instruction stating, “If you are not satisfied with our services, your written complaints shall be immediately attended to”. This finding is not fully attuned to the rule that the procedure for filing complaints shall be included in the Citizen’s Charter.

The findings are somewhat similar with the assessment of PSC, 2006 on the implementation of Batho Pele in South Africa as mentioned by Negussa, 2014 that it was found that 90 percent of national departments and 84 percent of provincial departments had some form of complaints handling system. But many of these systems are not formalized: they do not have written guidelines, recorded complaints, or monitored and evaluated service delivery. Standards and complaint procedures are not reviewed to determine if the departments’ redress and client-care objectives are being met. However, Goyal (2015) posited that right attitude of the staff towards the complaints is more essential than having simply procedures. For Abera (2015), complaint handling mechanisms should be reconsidered and should be more responsive to clients.

Table 4b. Assessment of employee-respondents on compliance to Citizen’s Charter Provisions

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
1	“No noon break” policy is observed and clients are attended to even after official work hours	4.71	E
2	Official receipt is issued for all payments collected	4.62	E
3	Citizen’s Charter and anti-fixer campaign materials are published and posted at the main entrance of the office or at a very conspicuous place	4.25	VG
4	Official identification card of employees transacting with the clients is easy to read and visibly worn	4.18	VG
5	Public Assistance and Complaints Desk (PACD) is established and manned by a knowledgeable officer of the day even during break time	4.14	VG
6	Citizen’s Charter is written either in English, Filipino, or in local dialect and available as an information material (e.g., booklet, brochure or leaflets)	4.08	VG
7	Citizen’s Charter uploaded in the University’s website is accessible	3.91	VG
8	Procedures for making complaints are presented	3.75	VG
GRAND MEAN		4.21	VG

Frontline Service Delivery

Table 4c shows that the level of implementation on the aspects of frontline service delivery was very good as perceived by the clients. The overall mean rating of 4.47 implies that aspects in frontline service delivery were almost fully implemented. As a result, clients perceived that they received a very good service from the frontline service providers.

Table 4c. Assessment of client-respondents on frontline service delivery

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
1	Exact amount of necessary fees is collected (if applicable) with no extra payment	4.63	E
2	Step-by-step procedure of the service availed is followed	4.55	E
3	Only the documents listed in the charter are required	4.45	VG
4	Quality service is received	4.38	VG

5	Maximum time to conclude the process as indicated in the Charter is reasonable (<i>including allowable period for extension due to unusual circumstances</i>)	4.35	VG
GRAND MEAN		4.47	VG

Likewise, employees rated their implementation as very good with an overall mean rating of 4.29. They gave an excellent rating in exact amount of necessary fees is collected with no extra payment of 4.57. While they gave a lowest but still denoting a positive rating in only the documents listed in the Charter are required of 4.05.

Results revealed that clients' overall mean rating of 4.47 was higher than employees' rating of 4.29. This indicates a positive attitude of clients towards the services rendered by the employees who in turn have tried to render better services rightfully for the clients in line with the effort to fully comply all the service standards specified in the Charter. However, there are critical areas in frontline service delivery that should be given attention to like on the aspects that "only the documents listed in the Charter are required" and "step-by-step procedure rendered is followed" that were given a positive assessment but are observed to be at the bottom of the indicators in terms of frontline service delivery. This signifies that compliance on the promised standards particularly on list of required documents to be presented by the clients, are critical as this violates the law, if not fully implemented and complied with. Thus, there were slight inconsistencies on the performance of specified standards in the Charter versus actual service delivery.

Table 4d. Assessment of employee-respondents on frontline service delivery

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
1	Exact amount of necessary fees is collected (if applicable) with no extra payment	4.57	E
2	Quality service is delivered	4.32	VG
3	Maximum time to conclude the process as indicated in the Charter is reasonable (<i>including allowable period for extension due to unusual circumstances</i>)	4.29	VG
4	Step-by-step procedure of the service rendered is followed	4.20	VG
5	Only the documents listed in the charter are required	4.05	VG
GRAND MEAN		4.29	VG

Service Quality

As to service quality, Table 4e revealed that the implementation by the frontline employees as assessed by the client-respondents has an overall mean rating of 4.35 described as very good. The result implied that, clients have availed the services from the frontline service providers with a very good service quality as they perceived that frontline service providers highly met the standards for this aspect.

This negates the findings of Rahman (2013) that in Bangladesh, since the adaptation of the Citizen's Charter in 2007, no interest has been observed among the people, even among the literate persons on the Charter since there were no significant changes in the quality of services before and after the adoption of charters. While Saguin (2013) revealed that the posting of Citizen's Charter appears to have resulted in a better – informed citizenry because citizens asked fewer questions and lodged less complaints.

Table 4e. Assessment of client-respondents on service quality

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
Fairness			
1	"First come, first served" basis is followed	4.44	VG
2	Clients are treated fairly	4.39	VG
		4.42	VG
Knowledge and Competence of the Employee			
3	Have extensive information and understanding of the service provided	4.44	VG
4	Ready to respond to client's request	4.38	VG

	4.41	VG
Outcome/Result		
5 Output of service is correct and accurate	4.39	VG
Timeliness		
6 Transaction ended within the specified time	4.32	VG
7 I am immediately attended to	4.28	VG
	4.30	VG
Attitude of the Employee		
8 Willing to do more than what the client needs	4.23	VG
9 Entertain/greet clients upon serving	4.22	VG
GRAND MEAN	4.35	VG

Similarly, employees shared the same assessment with the clients as very good with an overall mean rating of 4.36. They believed that they rendered services with fairness, exhibited knowledge and competence, concerned on the outcome/result as well as timeliness and showed a pleasant attitude to the clients.

While the employees shared the same overall assessment with the clients', one of the factors on service quality which was assessed as excellent is higher than that of the clients' as very good. This connotes that employees believed that they were completely fair to everyone however their actions may not have totally reached the end of every client.

Attitude of the employees though positively assessed by both the clients and employees, obtained the lowest means. This implies that employees were aware that they may have shortchanged the incoming clients and were not able to extend extra assistance to them due to some factors that from time to time affect in the performance of their duty. Some concerns were limited number of employees and multiple assignments. Sometimes due to unexpected volume of clients that needs to be catered, the common process in service delivery which sign in from a warm greeting and sign-off to a pleasant goodbye were slightly sacrificed. As a result, sometimes some clients perceived employees to be slightly unresponsive and impolite. This finding is evident in Azizah's (2008) study where attitude of staff was measured in terms of the 'greeting' standard. It revealed that in practice not all frontliners always accomplish this standard due to number of staff available and the number of transacting public.

Table 4f. Assessment of employee-respondents on service quality

INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
Fairness		
1 "First come, first served" basis is followed	4.52	E
2 Clients are treated fairly	4.48	VG
	4.50	E
Knowledge and Competence of the Employee		
3 Ready to respond to client's request	4.37	VG
4 Have extensive information and understanding of the service provided	4.31	VG
	4.34	VG
Outcome/Result		
5 Output of service is correct and accurate	4.34	VG
Timeliness		
6 Immediately attend to clients	4.42	VG
7 Transaction ended within the specified time	4.25	VG
	4.34	VG
Attitude of the Employee		
8 Entertain/greet clients upon serving	4.28	VG
9 Willing to do more than what the client needs	4.25	VG
	4.27	VG
GRAND MEAN	4.36	VG

FEEDBACK AND REDRESS MECHANISM

As presented in Table 4g, the level of implementation in terms of feedback and redress mechanism as perceived by clients was given an overall mean rating of 3.02 described as good. All statements under this aspect were assessed

as good. However, fifty-eight (24.17%) of the client-respondents did not give ratings for this aspect because they claimed that they did not undergo the process for these standards during the conduct of the study.

Table 4g. Assessment of client-respondents on feedback and redress mechanism

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
1	Apology and effective remedy are received if the promised standard of service is not delivered	3.19	G
2	Outright action to complaints is provided	3.10	G
3	Clients are encouraged to accomplish Feedback Form and putting it in the box provided for	2.77	G
GRAND MEAN		3.02	G

Conversely, employees gave an overall assessment of very good with an overall rating of 3.84. They claimed that all indicators in this aspect were almost fully implemented.

Table 4h. Assessment of employee-respondents on feedback and redress mechanism

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
1	Apology and effective remedy are offered if the promised standard of service is not delivered	4.08	VG
2	Outright action to complaints is provided	3.83	VG
3	Clients are encouraged to accomplish Feedback Form and putting it in the box provided for	3.60	VG
GRAND MEAN		3.84	VG

It can be gleaned in the tables 4g and 4h that both the respondents do not share the same overall assessment. The lowest rated aspects from both the respondents were observed in obtaining of feedback. Though positively assessed, clients perceived it as least practiced in the frontline offices. This means that the generating system on feedback was not fully functional. There were four clients who stated that they never had an experience where frontline employees encouraged them to give their feedback. Meanwhile, even though the WPU Citizen’s Charter specifies the different avenues by which the clients can freely express feedback and complaints like call, e-mail, complaint letter and feedback forms yet clients were limited to do so because there was no display of procedures in the offices neither in the Public Assistance and Information Desk (PACD). While others had no interest in giving their feedback maybe because they were too in a hurry or they do not feel the need to comment because the output of service they needed was accurately done.

Moreover, there was no record of formal complaints in relation to frontline services filed and acted during the conduct of the survey as per validation with the WPU’s Grievance Committee. Other complaints especially if the promised standard of service was not delivered were acted independently by concerned offices through offering an apology and effective remedy.

Physical Working Condition

Table 4i revealed that clients positively assessed both physical set-up and basic facilities with an overall rating of 4.07. This connotes that almost all the requirements of the law were having met satisfactorily by the frontline offices. Aspect of cleanliness and orderliness of the office premise topped the assessment. However, the lowest mean but still denoting a very good evaluation can be observed under basic facilities particularly the available special lanes and facilities for persons with disability.

Table 4i. Assessment of client-respondents on physical working condition

	INDICATORS	MEAN	DR
Physical Set-up			
1	Cleanliness and orderliness of office premises	4.39	VG
2	Accessibility of offices providing frontline services	4.37	VG
3	Sufficient signages or direction guides for clients	4.31	VG
4	Lighting and ventilation of offices	4.30	VG
5	Customer-friendly layout of offices	4.27	VG
		4.33	VG
Basic Facilities			

6	Clean comfort rooms	3.92	VG
7	Convenient waiting area	3.80	VG
8	Available special lanes and facilities for pregnant women and the elderly	3.78	VG
9	Available special lanes and facilities for persons with disability	3.77	VG
		3.82	VG
GRAND MEAN		4.07	VG

On the other hand, employees also assessed both the physical set-up and basic facilities as very good. Employees believed that the offices providing frontline services were highly accessible. In contrast, convenient waiting area for clients turned-out to be the least rated among other indicators. The administration may consider the need for improvement in the waiting area and for other basic facilities for the comfort of every client and employee transacting business in the frontline offices. As comfort is the most important aspect of customer service facilities particularly if customers are required to wait (CSC-SDEP 2010).

Table 4j. Assessment of employee-respondents on physical working condition

INDICATORS		MEAN	DR
Physical Set-up			
1	Accessibility of offices providing frontline services	4.31	VG
2	Sufficient signages or direction guides for clients	4.20	VG
3	Customer-friendly layout of offices	4.17	VG
4	Lighting and ventilation of offices	4.14	VG
5	Cleanliness and orderliness of office premises	4.11	VG
		4.19	VG
Basic Facilities			
6	Available special lanes and facilities for pregnant women and the elderly	3.78	VG
7	Available special lanes and facilities for persons with disability	3.75	VG
8	Clean comfort rooms	3.69	VG
9	Convenient waiting area	3.65	VG
		3.72	VG
GRAND MEAN		3.95	VG

Summary of mean ratings on level of implementation of the Citizen’s Charter in Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan

Table 4k shows the summary of weighted means of the responses of the client-respondents and employee-respondents on the level of Citizen’s Charter implementation. Ranked accordingly from the highest to the lowest are the following: ranked 1st, frontline service delivery with a mean rating of 4.38 described as very good; ranked 2nd, service quality with a mean rating of 4.36 described as very good; ranked 3rd, compliance to Citizen’s Charter provisions with a mean rating of 4.19 described as very good; ranked 4th, physical working condition with a mean rating of 4.01 described as very good; and ranked 5th, feedback redress mechanism with a mean rating of 3.43 described as good.

The level of Citizen’s Charter implementation among frontline service providers of Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan based on the grand mean of 4.07 was very good.

It can be gleaned from the table that there was a consensus response from the two groups of respondents except on the aspect of feedback and redress mechanism which obtained the lowest assessment but still denoting a positive rating. Results revealed that though the overall rating obtained a very positive assessment, it still denotes that there are aspects in the implementation that frontline service providers may strive fully to comply with all the provisions required by law. Frontline service providers still need more intensive implementation through continual adherence of the law and appreciation of the Citizen’s Charter to deliver excellent public service.

Table 4k. Summary of mean ratings on level of implementation of the Citizen’s Charter in Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan

ASPECTS	CLIENTS N=240		EMPLOYEES N=65		OVERALL		R
	MR	DR	MR	DR	MR	DR	
	4.16	VG	4.21	VG	4.19	VG	3

Compliance to Citizen's Charter Provisions							
Frontline Service Delivery	4.47	VG	4.29	VG	4.38	VG	1
Service Quality	4.35	VG	4.36	VG	4.36	VG	2
Feedback and Redress Mechanism	3.02	G	3.84	VG	3.43	G	5
Physical Working Condition	4.07	VG	3.95	VG	4.01	VG	4
GRAND MEAN					4.07	VG	

Difference Between Client-Respondents and Employee-Respondents about their Level of Assessment on the following: Compliance to Citizen’s Charter Provisions, Frontline Service Delivery, Service Quality, Feedback and Redress Mechanism, and Physical Working Condition

The difference between client and employee respondents about their level of assessment was analysed using t-test at .01 and .05 level of significance. The table shows that compliance to citizen’s charter had a t-value of 1.167. However, since the p-value of .281 is greater than .05 level of significance, the null hypothesis is accepted. The same thing with service quality with t-value of .619 and p-value of .553, the difference is not significant. Moreover, their assessment on frontline service delivery (t-value = 4.685), feedback and redress mechanism (t = 17.5), and physical working condition (t = 8.909) have a significant difference as shown by the p-values of .009, .003, and .000, respectively.

Table 5. Difference between client-respondents and employee-respondents about their level of assessment on the following: compliance to Citizen’s Charter, frontline service delivery, service quality, feedback and redress mechanism, and physical working condition

VARIABLES	T-VALUE	P-VALUE
Compliance to Citizen’s Charter Provisions	1.167 ^{ns}	.281
Frontline Service Delivery	4.685 ^{**}	.009
Service Quality	0.619 ^{ns}	.553
Feedback and Redress Mechanism	17.5 ^{**}	.003
Physical Working Condition	8.909 ^{**}	.000

Note:

- ns – not significant
- * – significant at 0.05 level
- ** – significant at 0.01 level

Problems Encountered in the Implementation of the Citizen’s Charter and Suggestions for Improvement

Ten years since the implementation of Citizen’s Charter in the Philippines particularly in all its government offices delivering frontline services, levels of implementation among agencies vary. As such, this study tried to find out the respondents’ feedback on issues confronted in the different frontline offices with the implementation of Citizen’s Charter in Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan. On the aspects of compliance to Citizen’s Charter provision, frontline service delivery, service quality, feedback and redress mechanism and physical working condition, varied problems were encountered by both the respondents that slightly affect their assessment on the level of implementation of the Citizen’s Charter in the University.

Compliance to Citizen’s Charter Provisions

On the core area of compliance with Citizen’s Charter provisions, Table 6a shows the different problems encountered by 18 (7.50%) client-respondents. Their suggestions for the improvement of this area were also provided.

While there were available Citizen’s Charter printed in a form of a large tarpaulin in the administration building as well in WPU’s website, these were not fully attractive to the clients. Issues on awareness and medium used for the Citizen’s Charter were among the concerns. One client claimed that there was lack of information campaign. As a result, four of them claimed that they were not knowledgeable about the Charter. Abera (2015) pointed out that proper publicity is required to ensure the citizens are aware of the Charter because this will remain merely a paper exercise of limited value if there is no communication with the users.

Meanwhile, on the publication and posting, there were comments that the Citizen’s Charter printed in a large tarpaulin is not readable especially in 10 meters away. It was also noticed that the anti-fixer poster was not posted in the main entrance. As to its availability in a form of reading materials, one client commented that there was no available booklet/ leaflets during the time of assessment. While on its accessibility in the website, the following comments of the clients involved: not an internet user, not aware on the availability of the Charter in the website, not posted in the website and not tried yet accessing the Charter in the website.

With regards to issuance of Official Receipt (OR), though it obtained an excellent rating, there was a comment that a delivery receipt was issued instead of official receipt and that there was an instance where official receipt was not issued automatically. While on the wearing of easy-to-read IDs, there was one who claimed that the employee attending her did not wear her identification card while other client commented that the employee’s ID was not visible because of its smaller size. On the other hand, Public Assistance and Complaints Desk was properly labeled. The desk was situated in the inner center portion of the main entrance hall which made it visible for the clients however one client did not provide rating in this aspect as she commented that she was not aware about this PACD. Still another client claimed that PACD is not manned at all times. This finding is similar to the study of Principe in 2009 where they found an Information Desk that was not always manned. Lastly, one client revealed that procedures for making complaints were not clearly presented.

Hence, they suggested the following: continue providing proper information about the Charter; make the Charter clearer and readable by printing it with larger fonts; use understandable language by translating it to Filipino language or in a local dialect; distribute reading materials and post the step-by-step procedures and service standards for making complaints.

As part of the customer service ethos, it is important to ensure that the Citizen’s Charter is conspicuously seen and felt by the transacting public (CSC-SDEP 2010) as this tells clients, “These are the steps you will have to undergo and the fees to be paid. Those other than what are stated are unauthorized and unnecessary” (CSC Reporter 2017, Vol. 38, No. 2, 2nd issue).

Table 6a. Problems encountered by the client-respondents on compliance to Citizen's Charter provisions

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=18)
Lack of knowledge on the Citizen’s Charter	4
Citizen' Charter published in the bulletin board is not readable	2
Lack of information campaign. Anti-fixer campaign poster is not posted in the main entrance. Not easily visible at the Registrar's Office	1
Citizen's Charter is not available as booklet/leaflet	1
Citizen's Charter is not posted in the agency's website	1
Accessing the Citizen's Charter in the website is not yet tried	1
Others do not use internet	1
Only delivery receipt was issued not an official receipt	1
Sometimes, issuance of official receipt is not immediate	1
Employee do not wear identification card	1
Employee's ID is not completely visible due to its smaller size	1
Not aware about PACD	1
PACD is not manned all the time	1
Procedures for making complaints are not clearly presented	1

Similarly, 16 (24.62%) employee-respondents have expressed their feedback. Aside on the issues related to the publications of the Charter and wearing of identification cards, they put emphasis on the presence of officer of the day at PACD as well as the capability of the employee manning the PACD. They confirmed that the desk was not attended to at all times. This finding is similar to the study of Principe (2009) that in Naga City, it was found that an Information Desk that was located at the side entrance of the city hall was not always manned. Another one client commented that the one manning the desk was not so knowledgeable with the functions of PACD of which the same feedback was presented in the study of Principe in 2009 that the person occupying the desk was not very well adept of information the public may need such as requirements for a specific service.

As such, following strictly the schedule in manning the PACD was suggested and that it should be manned by an employee who can readily answer the different concerns of the clients.

Moreover, though the observance of “no noon break policy” received an excellent rating, there were two respondents who disclosed that sometimes, some frontline offices had no transaction during noon break this may be due to lack of personnel to shift. This finding shows that the agency slightly halts its covenant to observe the “No Noon Break Policy”.

Table 6b. Problems encountered by the employee-respondents on compliance to Citizen's Charter provisions

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=16)
PACD is not manned by a knowledgeable officer of the day	3
PACD is not manned at all times	3
Frontline office employees rarely wear identification cards	2
Some frontline offices do not transact business during noon time	2
Clients do not read the Citizen's Charter	1
Lack of publicity on Citizen's Charter	1

Citizen's Charter is not easy to read because it is written in small font	1
Information materials are not visible and not always available	1
There are many clients transacting business at noon	1
Lack of personnel to shift that's why windows are not open for transaction at noon time	1

Frontline Service Delivery

Table 6c reveals the different feedbacks provided by nine (3.75%) client-respondents. Aspect of frontline service delivery was assessed as almost excellent by the client-respondents and even obtained the highest assessment among others. However, longer processing time was still experienced, one of these clients commented that there was no specific time on service delivery consequently, one of them perceived that service delivery was not efficient and effective because the students were still having hard time to request needed documents. A slight similarity to the findings of Lorzano et.al. (2013) that 8.1% of the respondents observed slow transaction and inconsistency on payment.

Further, there were clients who disclosed that the instructions and services given by the employees were not consistent.

Procedural standards of some of the frontline offices have indeed presented the required information which was mainly in matrix form. These information were the who's, what's, when's, where's and why's. However, on how to obtain a specific service or the step-by-step procedure in availing a particular service which is vital for someone who wants to avail the services expeditiously and serves as guide of employees in the performance of their duty was not sequenced clearly. As a result, some employees had varying views and inconsistencies on providing appropriate information and services.

On the other hand, one client revealed that there was an instance of shortchanging. Upon confirmation with the respondent, she clarified that it did not happen during the current transaction but it was during an enrolment a year ago. Shortchange is the act of giving insufficient or no change to a consumer who purchased a product or service (DTI-DAO No. 16-03, s. 2016).

Their suggestions involved: hastening of processes; consistency on the implementation; and adherence to rules.

Table 6c. Problems encountered by the client-respondents on frontline service delivery

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=9)
Lengthy processing time	4
Inconsistent	3
Concerned employees come late	1
Shortchanging	1

Likewise, eleven (16.92%) employee-respondents have expressed varied problems encountered in frontline service delivery. Some issues were on the varying levels of compliance with the required information of the Charter, inconsistencies in the information provided, availability of official signatories/concerned officials and work interruptions e.g. power interruptions which contribute to the delay of transactions as claimed by clients. One employee observed that there were isolated instances wherein the decision is specific to a person attending at the moment and the presence of "old school" style. She added that each transaction should be viewed according to need of proximity and that options are always available for consideration. Another, one of these employees was amenable that the time to conclude the processing of requested documents is unreasonable.

Consequently, their suggestions involve reducing workload of employees, regular application of policies and appropriateness on the processes of frontline service delivery.

Table 6d. Problems encountered by the employee-respondents on frontline service delivery

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=11)
Frontline services are varied, there are offices serving their mandates excellently while others do not	1
There are isolated instances wherein the decision is specific to person attending at the moment	1
Presence of "old school" style, where each transaction should be viewed according to need of proximity and that options are always available for consideration.	1
Procedures on how to avail the services are not visible or posted in some frontline offices	1
Some services are shortcuts	1

Many interruptions during working hours	1
Frequent power interruptions caused delay in delivering/retrieving most information	1
Time to conclude the processing of Transcript of Records (TOR) and other documents is unreasonable	1
Service delivery is not properly rendered	1
There were times that no officials is left in the office to sign or approve papers/request of the clients	1
Some clients transacted business in a very limited time; Sometimes, person in authority is not available	1

Service Quality

Study revealed that client-respondents positively perceived the service quality rendered by the frontline service providers. However, 27 (11.25%) of the client-respondents have expressed feedback. Common issues were on the undesirable behavior of employees towards clients: impoliteness, unresponsiveness, unwillingness to attend to costumer’s needs and unequal treatment. One client perceived that the employee looks like she does not enjoy her job.

Various studies have found that organizations lose most customers because of staff indifference to their needs in which in government, staff indifference creates bad reputation of the public towards government and that the major customer complaints are: job not done right; too slow; too expensive; indifferent personnel; unqualified personnel; and lack of courtesy (CSC-SDEP 2010).

Another issue that was raised was on the delay of transaction as they claimed of long queues and lengthy processing. As such, sometimes the transactions were completed not within the specified time.

As such, their suggestions involved employees’ proper conduct in dealing with clients and additional manpower to speed up transactions.

Table 6e. Problems encountered by client-respondents on service quality

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=27)
Employees are: not approachable, snobbish, not friendly, moody, not accommodating, very strict, annoying, acrimonious, do not entertain the clients well, do not greet and show good manners	13
Slow processes	5
Transaction ended not within the specified time	3
"Palakasan", employees give priority to someone or other persons they knew even other clients have already been scheduled earlier than they	3
Long queue	2
Sometimes the employee lacks the initiative or knowledge to assist the needs of students especially those who are not computer literate	1

On the other hand, 11 (16.92%) employee-respondents have likewise expressed feedback in their implementation. Three employees confirmed that sometimes there were some of them who were not showing proper behavior while serving the clients. One employee was amenable that sometimes clients were not attended to immediately due to multiple assignments given. Another employee confirmed that “first come, first served” basis was not followed at all times due to the unexpected volume of costumers. Yet, inspite of rendering quality service, client is still complaining.

Thus, ethos of pleasant demeanor among frontline employees of WPU towards clients and additional competent staff to finish the transaction within specified time were among their suggestions.

Table 6f. Problems encountered by employee-respondents on service quality

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=11)
Sometimes staff are moody and they are unapproachable and sometimes tend to shout at students	3
Due to multiple assignments given to every personnel, clients are sometimes not attended immediately	1
Lack of personnel	1

"First come, first serve" basis is not followed all the time due to unexpected volume of costumers	1
Long queue	1
Prescribed time in the Citizen's Charter is not properly implemented	1
Time indicated in the Charter is not met. Transactions are sometimes delayed	1
Fast delivery of service is rendered to client who has influence / connection inside the office	1
Some clients still have their complaints inspite of rendering quality service	1

Feedback and Redress Mechanism

Table 6g revealed the issues encountered by 11 (4.58%) client-respondents on the aspect of functionality of the feedback and redress mechanism. Some of the concerns were centered on the initiative in obtaining of feedback as there were four of them who commented that they never had an experience that frontline employees encouraged them to give their feedback. While, there were three who commented on indicators under feedback and redress mechanism: apology and effective remedy are received if the promised standard of service is not delivered; encouraged to accomplish feedback form and putting it in the box provided for; and outright action to complaints were not experienced during the assessment. Meanwhile, two clients noticed that there was no suggestion box for feedback in the frontline offices. There was also a comment from one of the clients that employees do not listen to student's opinion. Still another one disclosed that his complaint was not acted outright which was confirmed by one of the employees that indeed there was an instance that complaint lodged was not acted outright.

Table 6g. Problems encountered by client-respondents on feedback and redress mechanism

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=11)
Accomplishing feedback form and complaining were not encouraged and not experienced but should be practiced	4
Indicators under feedback and redress mechanism were not experienced	3
There is no box for feedback/complaints	2
Employees do not listen to student's opinion	1
Outright action to complaints is not provided	1

Similarly, 11 (16.92%) of the employee-respondents have confirmed some issues confronted in their implementation. Availability of feedback forms and suggestion box in the offices were among their concerns. Two employees said that there were no available feedback forms and a suggestion box in their office. As a result, some clients do not know that there were feedback forms to fill-up while others were not really interested to air their feedback. This result is somewhat similar to the findings of Principe (2009) that in Naga City, there was an absence of suggestion box anywhere in the city hall premises where such a feedback form can be dropped at.

The presence of WPU's feedback and redress mechanism information which can be seen in the later portion of Citizen's Charter is indeed complied with. However, as to its functionality, clients/costumers/citizens and providers of frontline services should be enticed to partake. Likewise, the step-by-step procedure and service standards for making complaints related to frontline service were not fully presented and not visibly displayed at conspicuous place as a result some clients were not aware and lack the interest of lodging complaint.

Table 6h. Problems encountered by the employee-respondents on feedback and redress mechanism

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=11)
No available feedback forms	2
Suggestion box is not provided	1
Suggestion box is not accessible. Some clients did not know that there are available feedback forms to fill up	1
Some clients do not air their feedback	1
Some clients are not interested in accomplishing feedback form while others are not aware of it	1
Some people are not receptive to suggestions particularly if this concerns them	1
Leniency - Irregular implementation of the feedback or evaluation scheme among clients (not regularly monitored)	1

Sometimes mistakes are ignored especially if the involved individual is a friend	1
Effective remedy was not observed	1
Complaints are not acted outright	1

Physical Working Condition

Study revealed that 34 (14.17%) clients raised different concerns on the present implementation under basic facilities. Issues on cleanliness of comfort rooms, accessibility, lighting, ventilation and orderliness and privileges for PWDs, elderly and pregnant women were among the concerns of the clients. However, convenience in the waiting area particularly the availability of chairs for clients is the most observed lacking in the frontline offices. Some of these clients commented that permanent chairs should be readily available as they noticed that they were provided during enrollment time only.

Table 6i. Problems encountered by the client-respondents on physical working condition

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=34)
No chairs in the waiting area	7
Dirty comfort rooms	4
No available special lane and facilities and no waiting area for pregnant women/PWDs	3
Sometimes pregnant women and PWDs could not enjoy their privileges, they just joined the lanes with the clients who don't need special attention	3
The Infirmary has small space	2
Lighting and ventilation of the Library are not enough	2
Facilities are not properly designed and the lay-out is not customer friendly	1
Going to the Infirmary is not easy because the distance is far (<i>Mahirap puntahan, malayo</i>). The area is a little bit far from other offices and colleges where the faculty and staff work	1
There were few clutters in front of the office	1
Misplaced documents	1
Crowded	1
Sometimes there are no available computer units to use and no specific place to wait	1
Other issues	
Power interruptions (Brown-out)	2
Inadequate sports facilities and equipment	1
Swampy during rainy days	1
Lack of ambulance	1
Lack of potable water	1

On the other hand, 16 (24.62%) employees commented on the present physical working condition of the office. Issues raised by the clients were almost the same concerns encountered by the employee-respondents. Hence, both respondents suggested the improvement and upgrading of the physical set-up and basic facilities particularly the setting up of convenient waiting area with adequate and comfortable seating.

Aside on the tidiness of facilities as well as the orderliness in the office, emphasis on good illumination and proper ventilation were likewise suggested to be considered. Because apart from the comfort that pleasant working condition provides to the clients, employees can also effectively deliver excellent service to the clients contributed by the healthy condition of the office. This is in agreement to the statement of Masucol (2014) that a general condition of the premises of an office contributes to the effectiveness of service delivery especially for offices rendering frontline services to the public.

Table 6j. Problems encountered by the employee-respondents on physical working condition

PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED	FREQUENCY (N=16)
No chairs in the waiting area	2
Dirty comfort rooms	2
The office is hot/warm (<i>mainit</i>)	2
Lighting and ventilation are not fully furnished due to lack of funds	1
There is a problem on the ventilation in the Library. The environment is hot/warm, not a conducive place to study	1
Sometimes comfort room is close	1
No comfort rooms for the public	1
No permanent waiting area with air-condition units	1
No convenient area provided for PWDs	1
No special lane / facility for PWDs, pregnant and the elderly	1
Sometimes signages are too many that cause confusion for those who do not have enough time to read	1
There are some offices whose tables are loaded with documents, sometimes they create destructions to clients	1
Lack of financial support in purchasing equipment and materials including additional collection of books	1

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions

Based on the findings of the study, the following conclusions were drawn:

1. Citizen’s Charter of Western Philippines University, Aborlan, Palawan was implemented by the frontline service providers. The level of Citizen’s Charter based on the overall mean of 4.07 was very good. Aspects on frontline service delivery with a mean rating of 4.38 described as very good topped the assessment, followed closely by service quality with a mean rating of 4.36 described as very good; compliance to Citizen’s Charter provisions with a mean rating of 4.19 described as very good; and physical working condition with a mean rating of 4.01 described also as very good; however, feedback and redress mechanism was the least rated indicator but still denoting a positive assessment with a mean of 3.43 described as good.
2. There was no significant difference between the two groups of respondents on their level of assessment in the aspect of compliance to Citizen’s Charter provisions and on service quality. However, their assessment on frontline service delivery, feedback and redress mechanism, and physical working condition has a significant difference.
3. Clients and frontline employees have expressed different concerns as what they consider as problems encountered in the implementation of the Charter. However, undesirable behavior of employees towards the clients was perceived to be the most felt problem in the frontline offices.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the results of the study, the following recommendations were made:

1. The agency may: continue the information campaign on Citizen’s Charter; hasten service processes through streamlining of processes to the minimum necessary to achieve an efficient yet quality service and start online transactions for enrollment and payment; require all frontliners to always act with high standard of ethics in public service; invigorate the feedback and redress mechanism by encouraging clients to give feedback and simultaneously display the updated “How to Avail of the Services” and the step-by-step procedure on filing and handling of complaints; and re-design the spaces of offices for ease of movement of the clients and employees, as well as the improvement of basic facilities for the convenience of all types of individual.
2. The agency may conduct reorientation to employees, students and other stakeholders about the Citizen’s Charter of the University once every two years.
3. Frontline office employees should always act with high standard of ethics in public service by extending prompt, courteous, and efficient service; show justness and sincerity and shall not discriminate against anyone; and always be guided with the Code of Conduct and Ethical Standards for Public Officials and Employees.
4. Similar studies may be conducted covering from enrollment period up to examination period with larger population or other aspects that enhance the understanding of public service and client’s satisfaction.

REFERENCES

BOOKS

1. LAZO, RICARDO S. 2010. *Principles and Practices of Public Administration in the Philippines*. Rex Printing Company Inc. 84-86 P. Flerentino St., Quezon City. pp. 63, 65, 84.
2. LEVERIZA, JOSE O. 1990. *Public Administration: The Business of Government*. Enchanis Press, Inc. 760 Boni Avenue, Mandaluyong, Metro Manila. P. 26-27.

JOURNALS

1. BOZEMAN, BARRY. 1993. *A Theory of Government "Red Tape"*. Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory: J-PART, Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 273-303.
2. GOYAL, SHAKTI. 2015. *Citizen's Charter: A Way Forward to Good Governance*. Journal for Studies in Management and Planning. Vol.1, Issue 6, pp.357-370.
3. SAGUIN, KIDJIE IAN C. 2013. *Critical Challenges in Implementing the Citizen's Charter Initiative: Insights from Selected Local Government Units*. Philippine Journal of Public Administration, Vol. LVII, no. 1, pp. 30-57.

THESES/DISSERTATION

4. AZIZAH, N. 2008. 'Transforming Citizen's Charter for Indonesia: A Study of Citizen's Charter in Yogyakarta City', (Thesis, Master in Urban Management and Development) IHS-Erasmus University Rotterdam, September 2008
5. BACOSA, PRUDELYN G., LIMBOS, ANGELINE J. & ESCUBIN, JOANA F. 2011. *Users Satisfaction of Computer Training Institute in Western Philippines University, San Juan, Aborlan, Palawan*. Unpublished Undergraduate Thesis. Western Philippines University. Aborlan, Palawan. pp. 21-22.
6. LORZANO, GRACELYN B., LAGRADA, ROCELYN B. & NANO, ROWEL A. 2013. *Assessment of Frontline Services of LGU-Narra, Palawan: Implications to R.A. 1984 Implementation*. Unpublished Undergraduate Thesis. Western Philippines University. Aborlan, Palawan. pp. 17-28.
7. LORZANO, NOVEE ANGELIE A. & MAGBANUA, JEJIELYN A. 2013. *Student's Satisfaction of the Services Rendered by the Registrar's Office of Western Philippines University (Main Campus)*. Unpublished Undergraduate Thesis. Western Philippines University. Aborlan, Palawan. pp. 29-30.
8. MASUCOL, LUZEL S. 2014. *Implementation of the Anti-Red Tape Act of 2007: The case of LGU-Maramag*. Unpublished Masteral Thesis. Mindanao University of Science and Technology, Cagayan de Oro City. pp. 1,71, 87-96.
9. PRINCIPE, ALVIN P. 2009. *Exploring Public Service Improvement Initiative: A Case Study of Citizen's Charter Implementation in Naga City*. Unpublished Masteral Thesis. Erasmus University in Rotterdam, The Netherlands. pp. 59-72.
10. SINGH, SHIVANI. 2012. *The Citizen's Charter and Citizens Friendly Administration in India: A comparative Study of Selected Organizations*. Unpublished Dissertation. University of Delhi. India. pp. 37.
11. VERGARA, ERROL JOHN G., SOLIVEN, CECILIO JR. B. & TAHIL, JEHOANNE B. 2013. *Satisfaction of Graduating Students on the Services Rendered by the Office of Student Services, Western Philippines University – Main Campus, Aborlan, Palawan*. Unpublished Undergraduate Thesis. Western Philippines University. Aborlan, Palawan. pp. 22-23.

DICTIONARY

12. WEBSTER'S DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS. 2002. Red Tape. Webster's Dictionary and Thesaurus. Geddes and Grosset David Dale House, New Lanark ML11 9DJ, Scotland.
13. WEBSTER'S DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS. 1993. Red Tape. In Webster's Third New International Dictionary. Merriam-Webster Inc., Springfield, Massachusetts, U.S.A.

GOVERNMENT ISSUANCES

14. BALA, ALICIA D. 2017. *Freedom from Red Tape*. CSC Reporter 2017, Vol. 38, No. 2, 2nd Issue. Civil Service Commission Central Office, IBP Road, Batasan Hills, 1126 Quezon City.
15. CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION. 2008. *Republic Act No. 9485 and its implementing rules and regulations* (CSC Resolution No. 081471). Diliman, Quezon City, Philippines.
16. CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION. 2010. Service Delivery Excellence Program Modules. CSC Regional Office.
17. CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION. 2017. *Requiring Government Agencies to Provide Express Lanes for Persons with Disabilities*. CSC MC No. 20, s. 2017. CSC Building, IBP Road, Constitution Hills, 1126 Quezon City.
18. LICUANAN, PATRICIA B. 2013. *Enhanced Policies and Guidelines on Student Affairs and Services*. CMO No. 9, s. 2013. Commission on Higher Education, CHED Central Office, C.P. Garcia Avenue, U.P. Diliman, Quezon City
19. LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACADEMY. 2007. Primer on RA 9485: The Anti- Red Tap Act of 2007. Manila, Philippines.
20. LOPEZ, RAMON M. 2016. *Implementing Rules and Regulations of R.A. No. 10909 "An Act Prohibiting Business Establishments from Giving Insufficient or No Change to Consumers and Providing Penalties Therefor"*. Department Administrative Order No. 16-03, series of 2016. Department of Trade and Industry, SF Industry and Investments Building, 385 Sen. Gil J. Puyat Avenue, 1200 Makati City, Philippines.

21. MONTEMAYOR, ETHEL T. ET. AL. 2017. *Citizen's Charter*. CSC Reporter 2017, Vol. 38, No. 2, 2nd Issue. Civil Service Commission Central Office, IBP Road, Batasan Hills, 1126 Quezon City.
22. PUNO, RONALDO V. 2008. *Primer on RA 9485: The Anti- Red Tap Act of 2007*. Local Government Academy. Manila, Philippines.
23. RECTO, RALPH ET.AL. 2017. *An Act Establishing a National Policy on Ease of Doing Business, Creating for the Purpose the Ease of Doing Business Commission, and for other Purposes*. Senate Bill No. 1311. 17th Congress of the Republic of the Philippines.
24. REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES. 2007. Anti-Red Tape Act. Republic Act No. 9485.

ONLINE SOURCES

25. ABERA, AKILU M. 2015. *The Impact of Citizen Charters to Establish Transparent and Accountable Public Service: The Case of Federal Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission*. <http://etd.aau.edu.et/bitstream/123456789/8600/1/Akilu%20Mulugeta.pdf>. Accessed on 29 Jan. 2017.
26. BARRETT, PAT. 2003. Government Sector Accountability - The Impact of Service Charters in the Australian Public Service. Conference Paper, Australia: Australian National Audit Office. Retrieved from <https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.645.8326&rep=rep1&type=pdf>. Accessed on 2 Mar. 2017.
27. HIRSH, JUDAH. 2016. *Four Ways to Better Deal With Bureaucratic Red Tape*. <https://www.salarium.com/four-ways-better-deal-bureaucratic-red-tape/>. Accessed on 13 Jan. 2017.
28. MENDOZA, MAGDALENA L. 2011. *Legislating Citizen's Charters*. http://umdcipe.org/conferences/Moscow/papers/Legislating%20Citizen's%20Charter_Mendoza_Philippines_01%20June%202011.pdf. Accessed on 4 Dec. 2016.
29. MERTON, R.K. 1957. *Social Theory and Social Structure*, Free Press, Glencoe.
30. MERTON, R.K. 1976. *Sociological Ambivalence and Other Essays* Free Press, New York,
31. MULLEN, JOHN. 2006. *John Major's Citizens Charter - fifteen years later*. In Raphaële Espiet-Kilty; Timothy Whitton (eds.). *Citoyens ou Consommateurs*. Presses Universitaire Blaise Pascal. <https://hal-normandie-univ.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-02536967/document>. Accessed on 4 Dec. 2016.
32. NEGUSSA, FEKADU. 2014. *A Critical Analysis of the Conceptualization and Implementation of Citizens' Charters: Case Studies from UK, India, South Africa and Ethiopia*. <http://iiste.org/Journals/index.php/PPAR/article/view/10495>. Accessed on 30 Jan. 2017.
33. POST, DAVID & SANJAY, AGARWAL. 2011. *Citizen Charters: Enhancing Service Delivery through Accountability*. World Bank's Social Development Department (SDV), <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTSOCIALDEVELOPMENT/Resources/244362-1193949504055/43480351298566783395/7755386-1301510956007/CC-Final.pdf>. Accessed on 10 Dec. 2016.
34. RAHMAN, DILARA. 2013. *Citizen's Charter in Practice: The Cultural Challenge towards Administrative Systems in Bangladesh*. <https://govpoliju.com/citizens-charter-in-practice-the-cultural-challenge-towards-administrative-systems-in-bangladesh/>. Accessed on 30 Jan. 2017.
35. WEBER, M. 1978, *Economy and Society*. Ed. G. Roth, C. Wittich. Berkeley: University of California Press.